Why dividing by n-1 yields an unbiased estimate of the population variance

Kristopher J. Preacher

2/15/12

First, prove that $E\left[x_i^2\right] = \sigma^2 + \mu^2$:

$$\sigma^{2} = E\left[\left(x_{i} - E\left[x_{i}\right]\right)^{2}\right]$$

$$= E\left[\left(x_{i} - E\left[x_{i}\right]\right)\left(x_{i} - E\left[x_{i}\right]\right)\right]$$

$$= E\left[x_{i}^{2} - x_{i}E\left[x_{i}\right] - E\left[x_{i}\right]x_{i} + E\left[x_{i}\right]E\left[x_{i}\right]\right]$$

$$= E\left[x_{i}^{2} - 2x_{i}\mu + \mu^{2}\right]$$

$$= E\left[x_{i}^{2}\right] - 2\mu E\left[x_{i}\right] + E\left[\mu^{2}\right]$$

$$= E\left[x_{i}^{2}\right] - 2\mu^{2} + \mu^{2}$$

$$= E\left[x_{i}^{2}\right] - \mu^{2}$$

It follows that $E\left[x_i^2\right] = \sigma^2 + \mu^2$. We make use of this identity in the following.

Exhibit 1: The expectation of the sample variance (dividing by n) leads to a <u>biased</u> estimate of σ^2 :

$$\begin{split} E\left[S^{2}\right] &= E\left[\frac{\sum_{i=1}^{n}(x_{i}-\overline{x})^{2}}{n}\right] \\ &= \frac{1}{n}E\left[\sum_{i=1}^{n}(x_{i}-\overline{x})(x_{i}-\overline{x})\right] \\ &= \frac{1}{n}E\left[\sum_{i=1}^{n}(x_{i}^{2}-2x_{i}\overline{x}+\overline{x}^{2})\right] \\ &= \frac{1}{n}\sum_{i=1}^{n}\left(E\left[x_{i}^{2}\right]-2E\left[x_{i}\overline{x}\right]+E\left[\overline{x}^{2}\right]\right) \\ &= \frac{1}{n}\sum_{i=1}^{n}\left(E\left[x_{i}^{2}\right]-2E\left[x_{i}\overline{x}\right]+E\left[\left(\frac{1}{n}\sum_{i=1}^{n}x_{i}\right)^{2}\right]\right) \\ &= \frac{1}{n}\sum_{i=1}^{n}\left(E\left[x_{i}^{2}\right]-\frac{2}{n}E\left[x_{i}\sum_{i=1}^{n}x_{i}\right]+\frac{1}{n^{2}}E\left[\left(\sum_{i=1}^{n}x_{i}\right)^{2}\right]\right) \\ &= \frac{1}{n}\sum_{i=1}^{n}\left(E\left[x_{i}^{2}\right]-\frac{2}{n}E\left[x_{i}\left(x_{i}+\sum_{i\neq j}x_{j}\right)\right]+\frac{1}{n^{2}}E\left[\sum_{i=1}^{n}x_{i}^{2}+\sum_{i\neq j}x_{i}x_{j}\right]\right) \\ &= \frac{1}{n}\sum_{i=1}^{n}\left(E\left[x_{i}^{2}\right]-\frac{2}{n}\left[\left(E\left[x_{i}^{2}\right]+E\left[x_{i}\sum_{i\neq j}x_{j}\right]\right)\right]+\frac{1}{n^{2}}\sum_{i=1}^{n}E\left[x_{i}^{2}\right]+\frac{1}{n^{2}}\sum_{i\neq j}E\left[x_{i}\right]E\left[x_{j}\right]\right) \\ &= \frac{1}{n}\sum_{i=1}^{n}\left(E\left[x_{i}^{2}\right]-\frac{2}{n}E\left[x_{i}^{2}\right]-\frac{2}{n}(n-1)E\left[x_{i}x_{j}\right]+\frac{1}{n^{2}}\sum_{i=1}^{n}E\left[x_{i}^{2}\right]+\frac{1}{n^{2}}\sum_{i\neq j}E\left[x_{i}\right]E\left[x_{j}\right]\right) \\ &= \frac{1}{n}\sum_{i=1}^{n}\left(\left(\sigma^{2}+\mu^{2}\right)-\frac{2}{n}\left(\sigma^{2}+\mu^{2}\right)-\frac{2}{n}(n-1)\mu^{2}+\frac{1}{n^{2}}n\left(\sigma^{2}+\mu^{2}\right)+\frac{1}{n^{2}}n(n-1)\mu^{2}\right) \\ &= \sigma^{2}+\mu^{2}-\frac{2}{n}\sigma^{2}-\frac{2}{n}\mu^{2}-2\mu^{2}+\frac{2}{n}\mu^{2}+\frac{1}{n}\sigma^{2}+\frac{1}{n}\mu^{2}+\mu^{2}-\frac{1}{n}\mu^{2} \\ &= \sigma^{2}-\frac{\sigma^{2}}{n} \end{split}$$

...which underestimes σ^2 by a factor of $1 - \frac{1}{n} = \frac{n-1}{n}$.

Exhibit 2: The expectation of the sample variance (dividing by n-1) leads to an <u>unbiased</u> estimate of σ^2 :

$$\begin{split} E\left[s^{2}\right] &= E\left[\frac{\sum_{i=1}^{n}(x_{i}-\overline{x})^{2}}{n-1}\right] \\ &= \frac{1}{n-1}E\left[\sum_{i=1}^{n}(x_{i}-\overline{x})(x_{i}-\overline{x})\right] \\ &= \frac{1}{n-1}E\left[\sum_{i=1}^{n}(x_{i}^{2}-2x_{i}\overline{x}+\overline{x}^{2})\right] \\ &= \frac{1}{n-1}\sum_{i=1}^{n}\left(E\left[x_{i}^{2}\right]-2E\left[x_{i}\overline{x}\right]+E\left[\overline{x}^{2}\right]\right) \\ &= \frac{1}{n-1}\sum_{i=1}^{n}\left(E\left[x_{i}^{2}\right]-2E\left[x_{i}\overline{x}\right]+E\left[\left(\frac{1}{n}\sum_{i=1}^{n}x_{i}\right)^{2}\right]\right) \\ &= \frac{1}{n-1}\sum_{i=1}^{n}\left(E\left[x_{i}^{2}\right]-\frac{2}{n}E\left[x_{i}\sum_{i=1}^{n}x_{i}\right]+\frac{1}{n^{2}}E\left[\left(\sum_{i=1}^{n}x_{i}\right)^{2}\right]\right) \\ &= \frac{1}{n-1}\sum_{i=1}^{n}\left(E\left[x_{i}^{2}\right]-\frac{2}{n}E\left[x_{i}\left(x_{i}+\sum_{i\neq j}x_{j}\right)\right]+\frac{1}{n^{2}}E\left[\sum_{i=1}^{n}x_{i}^{2}+\sum_{i\neq j}x_{i}x_{j}\right]\right) \\ &= \frac{1}{n-1}\sum_{i=1}^{n}\left(E\left[x_{i}^{2}\right]-\frac{2}{n}E\left[x_{i}^{2}\right]+E\left[x_{i}\sum_{i\neq j}x_{j}\right]\right)+\frac{1}{n^{2}}\sum_{i=1}^{n}E\left[x_{i}^{2}\right]+\frac{1}{n^{2}}\sum_{i\neq j}E\left[x_{i}\right]E\left[x_{j}\right]\right) \\ &= \frac{1}{n-1}\sum_{i=1}^{n}\left(E\left[x_{i}^{2}\right]-\frac{2}{n}E\left[x_{i}^{2}\right]-\frac{2}{n}(n-1)E\left[x_{i}x_{j}\right]+\frac{1}{n^{2}}\sum_{i=1}^{n}E\left[x_{i}^{2}\right]+\frac{1}{n^{2}}\sum_{i\neq j}E\left[x_{i}\right]E\left[x_{j}\right]\right) \\ &= \frac{n}{n-1}\left(\left(\sigma^{2}+\mu^{2}\right)-\frac{2}{n}\left(\sigma^{2}+\mu^{2}\right)-\frac{2}{n}(n-1)\mu^{2}+\frac{1}{n^{2}}n\left(\sigma^{2}+\mu^{2}\right)+\frac{1}{n^{2}}n(n-1)\mu^{2}\right) \\ &= \frac{n}{n-1}\left(\sigma^{2}-\frac{1}{n}\sigma^{2}\right) \\ &= \left(\frac{n}{n-1}-\frac{1}{n-1}\right)\sigma^{2} \\ &= \sigma^{2} \end{split}$$